



GRETCHEN WHITMER
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS
LANSING

ORLENE HAWKS
DIRECTOR

MICHIGAN BOARD OF REAL ESTATE BROKERS AND SALESPERSONS

FEBRUARY 13, 2023 MEETING

APPROVED MINUTES

In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, 1976 PA 267, as amended, the Michigan Board of Real Estate Brokers and Salespersons met on February 13, 2023, at 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper-Level Conference Room 4, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

CALL TO ORDER

Natalie Rowe, Real Estate Associate Broker, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Natalie Rowe, Real Estate Associate Broker, Chairperson
Chase Cantrell, Public Member
Christopher Germain, Real Estate Salesperson
Andrew Gutman, Real Estate Associate Broker
Maggie LaHaie, Public Member
Nusrat Moghul, Real Estate Broker

Members Absent: Abe Koumaiha, Real Estate Agent
Christian Rodriguez, Public Member
Benjamin Smith, III, Real Estate Broker, Vice Chairperson

Staff: Dena Marks, Departmental Specialist, Boards and Committees Section
Rick Roselle, Senior Analyst, Compliance Section
Stephanie Wysack, Board Support Technician,
Boards and Committees Section

Rowe initiated introductions of board members.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by LaHaie, to approve the agenda, as presented.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION by Gutman, seconded by Cantrell, to approve the minutes from December 6, 2022, as written.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

REGULATORY CONSIDERATIONS

Hearing Reports

MOTION by Germain, seconded by Cantrell, to receive the hearing reports.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

Graystone Maddox

Moghul recused herself.

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by LaHaie, to discuss.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by LaHaie, to revoke the Respondent's license. Respondent is fined \$9,000.00 to be paid within six months. Respondent shall pay \$8,965.00 in restitution to the buyer within 30 days.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, LaHaie, Rowe
Nays: None
Recuse: Moghul

MOTION PREVAILED

Tamara J. Marc

Moghul recused herself.

MOTION by LaHaie, seconded by Cantrell, to discuss.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by LaHaie, to place the Respondent on probation for a minimum of one day, not to exceed one year, to complete 20 hours of continuing education in areas accepted by the board. Respondent is fined \$850.00 to be paid within 180 days. If Respondent fails to comply, the license shall be suspended for a minimum of one day until compliant. If Respondent fails to comply before the license expires, Respondent shall apply for relicensure.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, LaHaie, Rowe
Nays: None
Recuse: Moghul

MOTION PREVAILED

Aarika Lauryn Walton

Moghul recused herself.

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by LaHaie, to place the Respondent on probation for a minimum of one day, not to exceed one year, to complete 14 hours of continuing education in areas accepted by the board. Respondent is fined \$550.00 to be paid within 90 days. If Respondent fails to comply, the license shall be suspended for a minimum of one day until compliant. If Respondent fails to comply before the license expires, Respondent shall apply for relicensure.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, LaHaie, Rowe
Nays: None
Recuse: Moghul

MOTION PREVAILED

Consent Orders and Stipulations

Germain served as Chairperson for items 5.B.1. and 2.

Beal Properties LLC

Rowe recused herself.

MOTION by LaHaie, seconded by Cantrell, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

Discussion was held.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, LaHaie, Moghul
Nays: None
Recuse: Rowe

MOTION PREVAILED

Stewart Wright Beal

Rowe recused herself.

MOTION by Gutman, seconded by LaHaie, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

Discussion was held.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, LaHaie, Moghul
Nays: None
Recuse: Rowe

MOTION PREVAILED

Rowe resumed serving as Chairperson.

Patrick Devereaux

Germain recused himself.

MOTION by Gutman, seconded by LaHaie, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

Discussion was held.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Gutman, LaHaie, Moghul, Rowe
Nays: None
Recuse: Germain

MOTION PREVAILED

Petition for Reinstatement

Lee Scott

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by LaHaie, to discuss.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Germain, seconded by Cantrell, to deny the Petition for Reinstatement.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, LaHaie, Moghul, Rowe
Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

Board Member Resolution

Rowe presented a Resolution to Hassan Ahmad, Real Estate Association Broker, honoring the time he served on the Michigan Board of Real Estate Brokers and Salespersons.

Chair Report

Rowe stated that there were about six allegations that she will be assigning to board members.

Department Update

Marks stated that equipment has been installed in the meeting rooms for recording of board meetings, effective March 28, 2023. She stated that the board will need to be mindful of microphones and to make sure to speak loudly and clearly.

Marks announced that the department will hold board member training on March 9, 2023, at 1:00 p.m. via Zoom. All members are welcome to attend.

Wysack reminded Board members to check their state email on a regular basis.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held on June 5, 2023, at 10:00 a.m. at 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper-Level Conference Center Room 4, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

ADJOURNMENT

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by LaHaie, to adjourn the meeting at 10:40 a.m.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

Minutes approved by the Board on: June 5, 2023

Prepared by:
Stephanie Wysack, Board Support Technician
Bureau of Professional Licensing

February 13, 2023